## GCE Examinations Advanced Subsidiary / Advanced Level

## Decision Mathematics Module D2

# Paper F MARKING GUIDE

This guide is intended to be as helpful as possible to teachers by providing concise solutions and indicating how marks should be awarded. There are obviously alternative methods that would also gain full marks.

Method marks (M) are awarded for knowing and using a method.

Accuracy marks (A) can only be awarded when a correct method has been used.

(B) marks are independent of method marks.



Written by Craig Hunter, Edited by Shaun Armstrong © Solomon Press

These sheets may be copied for use solely by the purchaser's institute.

#### D2 Paper F – Marking Guide

| 1. | (a)                          | $x_{11} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Alan is assigned to the lawns} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$<br>$x_{12} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Alan is assigned to the hedgerows} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$<br>$x_{13} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Alan is assigned to the flower beds} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$<br>$x_{21} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Beth is assigned to the lawns} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$<br>$x_{22} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Beth is assigned to the hedgerows} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$<br>$x_{22} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Beth is assigned to the hedgerows} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$ |             |     |
|----|------------------------------|--|-------------|-----|
|    | <i>(</i> <b>b</b> )          | $x_{23} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Beth is assigned to the flower beds} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$ $x_{31} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Colin is assigned to the lawns} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$ $x_{32} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Colin is assigned to the hedgerows} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$ $x_{33} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if Colin is assigned to the flower beds} \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$ minimise  | B2          |     |
|    | ( <i>b</i> )<br>( <i>c</i> ) | $z = 4x_{11} + 4.5x_{12} + 6x_{13} + 3x_{21} + 4x_{22} + 5x_{23} + 3.5x_{31} + 5x_{32} + 6x_{33}$<br>$x_{11} + x_{12} + x_{13} = 1$ Alan has exactly one job<br>$x_{21} + x_{22} + x_{23} = 1$ Beth has exactly one job<br>$x_{31} + x_{32} + x_{33} = 1$ Colin has exactly one job<br>$x_{11} + x_{21} + x_{31} = 1$ lawns are done by one gardener<br>$x_{12} + x_{22} + x_{32} = 1$ hedgerows are done by one gardener<br>$x_{13} + x_{23} + x_{33} = 1$ flower beds are done by one gardener<br>$x_{12} > 0$ for all <i>i</i> , <i>i</i>   | B2<br>M1 A1 |     |
|    |                              | reference to balance   | B1          | (7) |

| Stage | Previous<br>tournament | Current<br>tournament | Value              |       |
|-------|------------------------|-----------------------|--------------------|-------|
| 1     | G                      | J                     | 2                  |       |
|       | _                      | K                     | 4*                 |       |
|       |                        | L                     | 1                  |       |
|       | Н                      | J                     | 3*                 |       |
|       |                        | K                     | 2                  |       |
|       |                        | L                     | 2                  |       |
|       | Ι                      | J                     | 2                  |       |
|       |                        | K                     | 5*                 | M1 A1 |
|       |                        | L                     | 3                  |       |
| 2     | D                      | G                     | $\min(5, 4) = 4^*$ |       |
|       |                        | Н                     | min(3, 3) = 3      |       |
|       |                        | Ι                     | $\min(3,5)=3$      |       |
|       | E                      | G                     | $\min(3, 4) = 3$   |       |
|       |                        | Н                     | $\min(5,3)=3$      |       |
|       |                        | I                     | $\min(6, 5) = 5^*$ |       |
|       | F                      | G                     | $\min(3, 4) = 3$   |       |
|       |                        | Н                     | $\min(6,3)=3$      | M1 A2 |
|       |                        | I                     | $\min(5, 5) = 5^*$ | -     |
| 3     | A                      | D                     | $\min(6, 4) = 4$   |       |
|       |                        | E                     | $\min(3, 5) = 3$   |       |
|       |                        | F                     | min(7, 5) = 5*     |       |
|       | В                      | D                     | $\min(5,4)=4$      |       |
|       |                        | E                     | $\min(5, 5) = 5^*$ |       |
|       |                        | F                     | min(4, 5) = 4      | -     |
|       | C                      | D                     | $\min(7, 4) = 4$   |       |
|       |                        | E                     | $\min(5, 5) = 5^*$ | M1 A1 |
|       |                        | F                     | $\min(5, 5) = 5^*$ | -     |
| 4     | None                   | A                     | $\min(5, 5) = 5^*$ |       |
|       |                        | B                     | $\min(3, 5) = 3$   | A1    |
|       | 1                      | C                     | min(3, 5) = 3      | 111   |

| row min.<br>5 20 12 18 5<br>6 18 15 16 6<br>4 21 9 15 4<br>5 16 11 13 5   |       |      |
|---|-------|------|
| reducing rows gives:  |       |      |
| $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$  | M1 A1 |      |
| col min. 0 11 5 8   |       |      |
| reducing columns gives:   |       |      |
| $   \begin{array}{ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$  |       |      |
| $\begin{array}{cccc} 0 & 1 & 4 & 2 \\ \hline 0 & 6 & 0 & 3 \\ \hline 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{array}$ (N.B. a different choice of lines will lead to the same final assignment) | A1    |      |
| 3 lines required to cover all zeros, apply algorithm  | B1    |      |
| $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$  |       |      |
| $-1 - 6 - 0 - 3 2 - 0 - 1 - 0^*$  | M1 A1 |      |
| 4 lines required to cover all zeros so allocation is possible   | B1    |      |
| Andrew reviews a film<br>Betty reviews a musical<br>Carlos reviews a ballet<br>Davina reviews a concert   | M1 A1 |      |
| total cost = $5 + 18 + 9 + 13 = \text{\pounds}45$   | Al    | (10) |

(d)

|                |     | I  | 3  | row     |  |
|----------------|-----|----|----|---------|--|
|                |     | Ι  | II | minimum |  |
|                | Ι   | 4  | -8 | -8      |  |
| A              | II  | 2  | -4 | -4      |  |
|                | III | -8 | 2  | -8      |  |
| column maximum |     | 4  | 2  |         |  |

max (row min) = -4 min (col max) = 2max (row min)  $\neq$  min (col max)  $\therefore$  no saddle point B1

M1 A1

(b) let B play strategies I and II with proportions q and (1 - q) expected loss for B against each of A's strategies:

A I 
$$4q - 8(1 - q) = 12q - 8$$
  
A II  $2q - 4(1 - q) = 6q - 4$   
A III  $8q + 2(1 - q) = 2 - 10q$   
giving  
V  $4$   
 $2$   
 $-2$   
 $-4$   
 $-6$   
 $-8$   
 $q = 0$   
III  
it is not worth player A considering strategy I  
for optimal strategy  $6q - 4 = 2 - 10q$   
 $\therefore 16q = 6, q = \frac{3}{8}$   
M1 A1  
B2

$$\therefore B \text{ should play I } \frac{3}{8} \text{ of time and II } \frac{5}{8} \text{ of time} \qquad M1 \text{ A1}$$
(c) let A play strategies II and III with proportions p and  $(1 - p)$   
expected payoff to A against each of B's strategies:  
 $B \text{ I} \qquad 2p - 8(1 - p) = 10p - 8$ 

B II -4p + 2(1-p) = 2 - 6p M1 A1 for optimal strategy 10p - 8 = 2 - 6p $\therefore 16p = 10, p = \frac{5}{8}$  $\therefore A$  should play I never, II  $\frac{5}{8}$  of time and III  $\frac{3}{8}$  of time M1 A1 value of game =  $(6 \times \frac{3}{8}) - 4 = -1\frac{3}{4}$  M1 A1 (15) **5.** *(a)* add dummy

|          | $S_1$ | $S_2$ | $S_3$ | Available |
|----------|-------|-------|-------|-----------|
| $W_1$    | 40    | 5     |       | 45        |
| $W_2$    |       | 18    | 22    | 40        |
| Dummy    |       |       | 15    | 15        |
| Required | 40    | 23    | 37    |           |

(b) taking 
$$R_1 = 0$$
,  $R_1 + K_1 = 8$   $\therefore K_1 = 8$   $R_1 + K_2 = 7$   $\therefore K_2 = 7$   
 $R_2 + K_2 = 10$   $\therefore R_2 = 3$   $R_2 + K_3 = 11$   $\therefore K_3 = 8$   
 $R_3 + K_3 = 0$   $\therefore R_3 = -8$ 

|            | $K_1 = 8$  | $K_2 = 7$  | $K_3 = 8$  |
|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| $R_1 = 0$  | $\bigcirc$ | $\bigcirc$ | (11        |
| $R_2 = 3$  | 9          | $\bigcirc$ | $\bigcirc$ |
| $R_3 = -8$ | 0          | 0          | $\bigcirc$ |

improvement indices,  $I_{ij} = C_{ij} - R_i - K_j$ 

$$\therefore I_{13} = 11 - 0 - 8 = 3$$
  

$$I_{21} = 9 - 3 - 8 = ^2 2$$
  

$$I_{31} = 0 - (^-8) - 8 = 0$$
  

$$I_{32} = 0 - (^-8) - 7 = 1$$

(c) applying algorithm

|       | $S_1$         | $S_2$        | $S_3$ |
|-------|---------------|--------------|-------|
| $W_1$ | $40 - \theta$ | $5 + \theta$ |       |
| $W_2$ | θ             | 18 – θ       | 22    |
| Dummy |               |              | 15    |

| 1 .  | 0          | 10  |         |
|------|------------|-----|---------|
| let. | $\theta =$ | 18  | giving  |
| 100  | •          | 10, | 51,1115 |

|       | $S_1$ | $S_2$ | $S_3$ |
|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| $W_1$ | 22    | 23    |       |
| $W_2$ | 18    |       | 22    |
| Dummy |       |       | 15    |

taking  $R_1 = 0$ ,  $R_1 + K_1 = 8$   $\therefore K_1 = 8$   $R_1 + K_2 = 7$   $\therefore K_2 = 7$  $R_2 + K_1 = 9$   $\therefore R_2 = 1$   $R_2 + K_3 = 11$   $\therefore K_3 = 10$  M1 A1  $R_3 + K_3 = 0$   $\therefore R_3 = -10$ 

|             | $K_1 = 8$  | $K_2 = 7$  | $K_3 = 10$ |
|-------------|------------|------------|------------|
| $R_1 = 0$   | $\bigcirc$ | $\bigcirc$ | (11        |
| $R_2 = 1$   | $\bigcirc$ | (10        | $\bigcirc$ |
| $R_3 = -10$ | 0          | 0          | $\bigcirc$ |

$$\therefore I_{13} = 11 - 0 - 10 = 1$$

$$I_{22} = 10 - 1 - 7 = 2$$

$$I_{31} = 0 - (^{-}10) - 8 = 2$$

$$I_{32} = 0 - (^{-}10) - 7 = 3$$
all improvement indices are non-negative  $\therefore$  pattern is optimal B1

22 rolls from  $W_1$  to  $S_1$ , 23 rolls from  $W_1$  to  $S_2$ , 18 rolls from  $W_2$  to  $S_1$ , 22 rolls from  $W_2$  to  $S_3$ ,  $S_3$  still requires 15 rolls A1 (16)

M1 A1

M1 A2

M1 A1

A1

M1

**6.** (a)



### **Performance Record – D2 Paper F**

| Question no. | 1                                      | 2                             | 3          | 4                            | 5  | 6  | Total |
|--------------|--|-------------------------------|------------|------------------------------|--|--|-------|
| Topic(s)     | allocation,<br>formulate<br>lin. prog. | dynamic<br>prog.,<br>maximin. | allocation | game,<br>graphical<br>method | transport.,<br>dummy,<br>n-w corner,<br>stepping-<br>stone | TSP,<br>nearest<br>neighbour,<br>shortcuts |       |
| Marks        | 7                                      | 10                            | 10         | 15                           | 16   | 17   | 75    |
| Student      |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |
|              |  |                               |            |                              |  |  |       |